
MINUTES

Meeting:	Planning Committee
Date:	Friday 17 April 2015 at 10.00 am
Venue:	Board Room, Aldern House, Baslow Road, Bakewell
Chair:	Mr P Ancell
Present:	Cllr D Birkinshaw, Cllr P Brady, Cllr C Carr, Cllr D Chapman, Cllr A R Favell, Cllr P Harrison, Cllr Mrs N Hawkins, Cllr H Laws, Cllr A McCloy, Ms S McGuire, Cllr Mrs K Potter, Cllr Mrs L C Roberts, Cllr Mrs J A Twigg, Cllr S Wattam and Cllr D Williams
Apologies for absence:	Cllr Mrs H Gaddum

31/15 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The minutes of the last meeting of the Planning Committee held on 13 March 2014 were approved as a correct record.

The Director of Planning gave an update on Minute 20/15. In response to a Member query he confirmed that scheduling would take precedent over listing and that this would apply in this instance. He reported that Derbyshire Dales District Council had approved an application to have the property listed as an asset of community value. This followed on from new legislation which came into force from 6 April 2015. Permitted development rights don't apply to assets of community value, so the applicant would now need to apply for permission to change the use to a shop. The applicant had been advised that the best way forward would be for the current application to be withdrawn and resubmitted. No response had yet been received.

The Director stated that the Parish Council were aware of this issue.

32/15 MEMBERS DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Item 6

Cllr D Williams declared a personal interest as a member of the YHA.

Cllr H Laws declared a personal interest as a member of English Heritage.

It was noted that all Members had received an email from Jackie Nally regarding this application.

Item 7

Cllr D Williams declared a personal interest as a member of the YHA.

Cllr H Laws declared a personal interest as a member of English Heritage.

Cllr A R Favell declared that he had received a number of approaches regarding this application but that he had an open mind.

Item 9

Cllr P Brady declared a personal interest as he knew the objector.

Cllr C Carr declared he had received an email from John Youatt..

Cllr A McCloy declared he had received an email from John Youatt.

Item 12

Cllr A McCloy declared a personal interest as he knew the applicant.

33/15 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The Chair reported that 11 members of the public had given notice to speak under the public participation at meetings scheme.

34/15 FULL APPLICATION - REPAIR AND ALTERATIONS TO CASTLETON HALL. DEMOLITION OF 1970'S BUNGALOW, VICTORIAN GAMES ROOM AND 1970'S DINING ROOM EXTENSION TO REAR OF PROPERTY. CONSTRUCTION OF NEW DOUBLE AND SINGLE GARAGE AND NEW SUN ROOM. SEPARATE CASTLETON HALL INTO TWO DOMESTIC PROPERTIES. INTERNAL ALTERATIONS TO REMOVE ALTERATIONS CARRIED OUT TO CONVERT THE BUILDING TO A YOUTH HOSTEL AND WORKS TO REINSTATE THE ORIGINAL BUILDING AESTHETIC AND BETTER SERVE THE BUILDING FOR DOMESTIC PURPOSES AT CASTLETON HALL, CASTLE STREET, CASTLETON

A supplementary update report had been tabled which gave details of further representations received from the objector with accompanying documents. The Director of Planning introduced all reports and advised the Committee that two decisions were required, one in respect of the planning application and another for listed building works. He and the report emphasised that special regard and considerable weight had to be given to preserving the listed building and enhancing or conserving the conservation area. The optimum use is as a single dwelling. Where there is harm to a listed building, a presumption of refusal arises as an aspect of statutory duty.

The following spoke on both this report and the listed building report under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr P Milner, Objector
- Mr R Chaudhry, Objector
- Ms S Marsh, Applicant

The recommendation for approval of the planning application, subject to conditions as detailed in the report, was moved and seconded. In response to Members' queries the Director stated that management of the front garden space could be controlled by a

condition or in a Section 106 agreement as part of management of the site. It was agreed that there would be harm to the dwelling from a two dwelling scheme albeit very much less than substantial. Members then debated the issue of two dwellings versus a single dwelling.

The Chair summed up why Members felt the single dwelling scheme would not happen. He stated that it was very unusual for somebody to take on something of this nature, which carried a whole series of substantial financial risks, and would make it not liable to happen. There was an individual with a particular desire to do something (a single dwelling scheme) but there was not a general feeling that there was a whole host of people willing to undertake that type of exercise and take on the financial risk. Members didn't doubt the intention but achieving the single dwelling, particularly given its size, was very unlikely. In the meantime, the building will deteriorate and cause harm to the Conservation Area with serious harm to matters of acknowledged importance.

If the building was separated into two dwellings then any harm would be extremely limited. The harm would be limited with regard to the features and character of the listed building and the subdivision would be easily achieved. Subdivision of the larger surrounding site had occurred soon after disposal by the YHA. The rear garden has no particular characteristics of historic garden or parkland. The historical reference to its use by English Heritage had been taken at a single point in time which it considered optimum. There was no overall coherence to the site.

Members considered that the public benefits of the two dwelling scheme would be rapidly moving forward with a deteriorating building to a very high standard of conservation. They accepted that this could also be achieved by a single dwelling scheme but felt the two dwellings would also introduce other benefits to Castleton (2 dwellings) and improve the sense community. Members would like to move forward with a scheme that is implementable and achievable.

The recommendation for the planning application of approval subject to conditions was voted on and carried unanimously.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to a section 106 legal agreement to secure the phasing of the works and to ensure sympathetic long term management of the two dwellings and to conditions covering the following (summary of conditions only):

- 1. The development hereby approved relates to the change of use of Castleton Hall and the retained Annex building to a single dwelling and the section of Castleton Hall referred to as the Tithe Barn to a single dwelling. There shall be no separate use of the Tithe Barn for paying bed and breakfast use.**
- 2. The development approved to be carried out in strict accordance with a timetable/programme of works which shall be submitted to and approved by the Authority.**
- 3. Ecology: Submit and agree detailed mitigation and monitoring strategy. All subsequent works shall then be carried out in accordance with any required scheme of mitigation.**
- 4. The demolition works shall be carried out in accordance with agreed timetable/programme of works prior to the occupation of the dwelling hereby approved.**
- 5. Samples of the replacement natural stonework, natural gritstone window door surrounds, natural lintels and sills, render treatments, railings, stonework**

- cleaning, cast iron rainwater goods shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Authority prior to carrying out the works requiring the samples. The scheme shall then be carried out in accordance with the agreed samples.
6. Detailed conditions relating to doors and windows, including details of the existing openings to be blocked up. Prior to the installation of any door/window frames or external timberwork, a scheme for the external finish of the timberwork to be submitted to and approved by the Authority. Once approved, development to be carried out in accordance with approved details.
 7. Prior to the installation of the window and door frames plans/details of the window/door reveals shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Authority. The scheme shall then be carried out in accordance with the agreed details.
 8. Existing rooflights in the south elevation of the Annex shall be removed and the roof made good with natural blue slate, to match the existing roof, in accordance with submitted plans. New rooflights shall be fitted flush with the roofslope.
 9. External face of the plinth walls of the detached greenhouse shall be clad with natural limestone.
 10. Detailed design conditions regarding external pipework, rainwater goods, external meter boxes.
 11. External walls of the new garage buildings hereby approved shall be clad with natural limestone, sample panel to be approved.
 12. Roof of the new garage buildings shall be clad with natural blue slate, sample to be approved
 13. Detailed design conditions regarding garage doors and openings. Retain garage for garaging and storage.
 14. Details of space within the site curtilage for the storage of plant and materials/site accommodation/loading and unloading of goods vehicles/parking and manoeuvring of site operatives and visitors vehicles to be submitted agreed and provided.
 15. All new boundary walling shall be erected in accordance with submitted plans and shall be constructed in natural limestone and capped with half-round natural limestone coping stones to match the existing boundary walling. Reduce width of opening from the Hall garden to Tithe Barn Garden.
 16. Carry out submitted landscaping and surfacing scheme, subject to additional hedging to car parking area in garden of the Hall.

35/15 LISTED BUILDING CONSENT APPLICATION: REPAIR AND ALTERATIONS TO CASTLETON HALL. DEMOLITION OF 1970'S BUNGALOW, VICTORIAN GAMES ROOM AND 1970'S DINING ROOM EXTENSION TO REAR OF PROPERTY. CONSTRUCTION OF NEW DOUBLE AND SINGLE GARAGE AND NEW SUN ROOM. SEPARATE CASTLETON HALL INTO TWO DOMESTIC PROPERTIES. INTERNAL ALTERATIONS TO REMOVE ALTERATIONS CARRIED OUT TO CONVERT THE BUILDING TO A YOUTH HOSTEL AND WORKS TO REINSTATE THE ORIGINAL BUILDING AESTHETIC AND BETTER SERVE THE BUILDING FOR DOMESTIC PURPOSES AT CASTLETON HALL, CASTLE STREET, CASTLETON

The recommendation for approval subject to conditions was moved, seconded, voted on and carried unanimously.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to a section 106 legal agreement to secure the phasing of the works and to ensure sympathetic long term management

of the two dwellings and conditions covering the following (summary of conditions only):

1. The development hereby approved relates to the change of use of Castleton Hall and the retained Annex building to a single dwelling and the section of Castleton Hall referred to as the Tithe Barn to a single dwelling.
2. The development approved to be carried out in strict accordance with a timetable/programme of works which shall be submitted to and approved by the Authority.
3. Ecology: Submit and agree detailed mitigation and monitoring strategy. All subsequent works shall then be carried out in accordance with any required scheme of mitigation.
4. The demolition works shall be carried out in accordance with agreed timetable/programme of works prior to the occupation of the dwelling hereby approved.
5. Samples of the replacement natural stonework, natural gritstone window door surrounds, natural lintels and sills, render treatments, railings, stonework cleaning, cast iron rainwater goods shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Authority prior to carrying out the works requiring the samples. The scheme shall then be carried out in accordance with the agreed samples.
6. Detailed conditions relating to doors and windows, including details of the existing openings to be blocked up. Prior to the installation of any door/window frames or external timberwork, a scheme for the external finish of the timberwork to be submitted to and approved by the Authority. Once approved, development to be carried out in accordance with approved details.
7. Prior to the installation of the window and door frames plans/details of the window/door reveals shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Authority. The scheme shall then be carried out in accordance with the agreed details.
8. Existing rooflights in the south elevation of the Annex shall be removed and the roof made good with natural blue slate, to match the existing roof, in accordance with submitted plans. New rooflights shall be fitted flush with the roofslope.
9. External face of the plinth walls of the detached greenhouse shall be clad with natural limestone.
10. Detailed design conditions regarding external pipework, rainwater goods, external meter boxes.
11. External walls of the new garage buildings hereby approved shall be clad with natural limestone, sample panel to be approved.
12. Roof of the new garage buildings shall be clad with natural blue slate, sample to be approved.
13. Detailed design conditions regarding garage doors and openings.
14. All new boundary walling shall be erected in accordance with submitted plans and shall be constructed in natural limestone and capped with half-round natural limestone coping stones to match the existing boundary walling. Reduce width of opening from the Hall garden to Tithe Barn Garden.
15. Carry out submitted landscaping and surfacing scheme, subject to additional hedging to car parking area in garden of the Hall.

The meeting was adjourned for a short break at 11.55am and reconvened at 12.00 noon.

36/15 FULL APPLICATION - CHANGE OF USE OF ALDERN HOUSE FROM LOCAL AUTHORITY OFFICES TO A MIXED USE OF LOCAL AUTHORITY OFFICES AND COMMERCIAL OFFICES IN A B1(A) USE, PEAK DISTRICT NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY, ALDERN HOUSE, BASLOW ROAD, BAKEWELL

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Dr P Owens, objector.

The recommendation of approval subject to conditions was moved and seconded.

In response to Members' queries regarding car parking at the site the Planning officer stated that the Highway Authority had no objections to the proposal and that the Authority's Environmental Management Officer would be reviewing the car parking spaces and considering a green travel plan.

The motion for approval was voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That, subject to no representations which raise material planning objections being received before the end of the consultation period, that the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions or modifications.

1. **Statutory three year time limit.**
2. **Development to be carried out in accordance with specified approved plans.**

37/15 FULL APPLICATION - INSTALLATION OF 4 CAMPING PODS WITHIN THE EXISTING CAMPSITE AND ALTERATIONS TO EXISTING CAMPSITE BUILDING INCLUDING REPLACING EXISTING WINDOWS AND DOORS ON SOUTH ELEVATION WITH TWO SETS OF DOUBLE DOORS AND REPLACING EXISTING METAL WINDOWS WITH TIMBER TO MATCH THE EXISTING AT NORTH LEES CAMPSITE, HATHERSAGE

Ms S McGuire declared a personal interest as a representative on the North Lees and Stanage Forum.

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr J Summerlin, supporter
- Mr S Hardwick, Peak Park Watch, objector.

The recommendation for approval subject to conditions was moved and seconded. However Members were divided and concern was expressed about the size of the pods, electricity supply and prevention of additional facilities. In response the Planning officers stated that the size of the pods proposed was stated in the application and the electricity supply was to allow for lighting in the pods. The prevention of additional facilities would be by conditions. It was agreed to include an extra condition to submit and agree a scheme of lighting and use of the electricity supply.

The motion for approval, with the extra condition, was voted on. The vote was tied and the Chair used his casting vote for the motion.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions or modifications.

1. **Statutory three year time limit for implementation.**
2. **Development to be carried out in accordance with specified approved plans.**

3. The camping pods shall not be sited anywhere within the application site other than in accordance with the plots identified on the approved plans.
4. No camping pod shall be replaced with any other structure or caravan at any time.
5. Restrict occupancy of camping pods to short term holiday letting purposes (no more than 28 days occupancy by any individual per calendar year) ancillary to North Lees Campsite. The camping pods and the existing campsite shall be retained within a single planning unit.
6. The roof tiles and external finish of the pods shall be in accordance with the approved samples / specifications and permanently maintained throughout the lifetime of the development.
7. No trees shall be felled within the area proposed to site the four camping pods other than in accordance with a details scheme (to include details and timing of any tree to be felled and subsequent species, size and location of any new planting) which shall have first been submitted to and approved by the National Park Authority.
8. No alterations to the amenity building shall be carried out other than between the period between the 1 October and the 1 May in the following year.
9. The new windows and doors within the amenity building shall be timber which at the time of erection shall be finished to match the colour of the existing timber windows and doors.
10. Access paths to the Camping pods to be surfaced with crushed gritstone, not limestone.
11. No external lighting.
12. Underground electricity line.
13. Prior to installation, submit and agree a scheme for the use of electricity within the Pods.

In accordance with the Authority's Standing Orders, the Committee voted to continue the meeting beyond 1pm.

The committee broke for lunch at 1.25pm and reconvened at 1.55pm.

Chair: Mr P Ancell

Present: Cllr D Birkinshaw, Cllr P Brady, Cllr C Carr, Cllr D Chapman, Cllr P Harrison, Cllr Mrs N Hawkins, Cllr A McCloy, Ms S McGuire, Cllr Mrs K Potter, Cllr Mrs L C Roberts, Cllr Mrs J A Twigg, Cllr S Wattam and Cllr D Williams.

38/15 FULL APPLICATION - ALTERATION AND CHANGE OF USE OF REDUNDANT STONE BARN, TO A THREE BED DWELLING AT NEW ELM TREE FARM, CHURCH LANE, PEAK FOREST

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Mr A Hollinrake, Applicant.

Members were supportive of the development if there was a need and it was tied to the farm but not as an open market development. A suggestion of deferral to allow for discussions with the applicant regarding a S.106 agreement was advised against by the Planning officer as negotiations had taken place with the applicant but had not progressed. It was noted that if the application was refused the applicant would be entitled to submit a revised application at no extra cost.

The recommendation for refusal was moved, seconded, voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be REFUSED for the following reasons:

1. **Contrary to Policy HC1C (I); the impetus of an open market housing is not required to achieve conservation and/or enhancement of a valued vernacular or listed building.**
2. **Inadequate amenity for future occupiers of any conversion as a result of the close proximity to a working farmyard and access.**

39/15 FULL APPLICATION - ERECTION OF 2 AGRICULTURAL BUILDINGS, CLIFFE HOUSE FARM, BRADFIELD

The Planning officer reported that amended plans had been received and were satisfactory.

2.38pm Cllr Mrs N Hawkins left the meeting.

The following spoke under the public participation scheme:

- Ms B Wardley, Objector
- Ms A Wardley, Objector
- Mr B Bryan, Agent

A motion to defer the application for a site visit to consider the effect of the large buildings on the landscape and the concerns raised by the objectors was moved and seconded. This was then voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That consideration of the application be DEFERRED pending a site visit to consider the impact of the development on the landscape.

40/15 FULL APPLICATION - ADDITIONAL USE (A3) TO SERVE HOT DRINKS IN EXISTING BOOKSHOP (A1) AT BAKEWELL BOOK AND GIFT SHOP, MATLOCK STREET, BAKEWELL

The following spoke under the public participation at meetings scheme:

- Ms J Pheasey, Applicant

The recommendation for approval subject to conditions was moved and seconded. It was agreed to remove condition 4 regarding restriction of times of use, and to amend condition 3 as stated in the officer report. The motion as amended was then voted on and carried.

3.10pm Cllr Mrs K Potter left the meeting. Cllr Mrs L Roberts re-joined the meeting.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

1. **The development hereby permitted shall begin not later than three years from the date of this decision.**

2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: Drawing No. 1704-02 A.
3. The development hereby permitted shall not place other than on the ground floor of the premises and the sale of food and drink from the premises shall be limited to the sale of hot and cold drinks for consumption on the premises and pre-pared or pre-packaged light refreshments such as cakes and biscuits.
4. No deliveries, loading, unloading or other servicing activities shall take place at the premises other than between the hours of 08.00 – 18.00 hours Monday – Friday; 09-00 – 13.00 hours on Saturday; and at no times on Sundays or Bank Holidays.

41/15 FULL APPLICATION - DEMOLITION OF EXISTING DORMER BUNGALOW AND REBUILDING 4 BEDROOM 2 STOREY HOUSE AT LEAHAY, MAIN STREET, ELTON

In response to a Members' query regarding condition 7 of the recommendation the Planning officer stated the Authority was able to include this type of condition until September 2015 when it was anticipated national building standards would be adopted by the Government because the Authority has a current policy requiring development to be built to a minimum Code Level.

The recommendation for approval subject to conditions was moved, seconded, voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That the application be APPROVED subject to the following conditions:

1. 3 year implementation time limit.
2. Adopt amended plans.
3. Submit and agree final finished floor levels of dwelling in relation to surrounding land.
4. Existing bungalow, outbuildings and garage to be demolished and removed from the site prior to the occupation of the dwelling hereby approved.
5. Remove permitted development rights for extensions, alterations and outbuildings, porches, walls, fences and solar panels.
6. Submit and agree hard and soft landscaping scheme.
7. Development to be built to a minimum Code Level for Sustainable Homes required of RSLs.
8. Submit a copy of the summary score sheet and Post Construction Review Certificate verifying that the minimum code level will be achieved.
9. Stonework to be in natural gritstone – sample panel to be agreed.
10. Openings on north facing gable end to be reduced to a French window of no more than 1.7m wide with a double casement above to match the adjacent double casement window in terms of size. Details to be submitted and agreed in writing.
11. Each light of casement window frames and long window on south facing elevation to be subdivided with a single horizontal glazing bar. Details to be submitted and agreed.
12. Garage to remain available for the parking of private domestic vehicles in connection with Leahay.
13. Parking and manoeuvring spaces to be provided and maintained.
14. Minor Design Details.

42/15 FULL APPLICATION - THE SITING OF A STATIC CARAVAN FOR USE AS HOLIDAY LET IN CONJUNCTION WITH USE BY FAMILY VISITORS ON OCCASIONS PLUS AN

ADDITIONAL PITCH FOR A TOURING CARAVAN AT THE QUIET WOMAN INN, EARL STERNDALE

Members were concerned about the untidy state of the site but were also aware of the importance of the property to the community. Therefore a motion for deferral of the application to allow for more details regarding landscaping of the site was moved and seconded. It was suggested that the Parish Council, local Members and other relevant bodies be involved in considerations.

The motion for deferral was then voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

That consideration of the application be DEFERRED to allow for more details regarding landscaping of the site.

3.38pm Cllrs A McCloy and S Wattam left the meeting.

43/15 MONITORING & ENFORCEMENT QUARTERLY REVIEW - APRIL 2015

The Director of Planning reported that the Monitoring & Enforcement Team Manager and himself had met with the Chief Executive on the previous day to discuss the Team's work and ideas for improvement were being considered.

The Director suggested that if cases of high priority were no longer considered high priority a report would be taken to Committee explaining the reasons and the current position. It was also noted that the Chief Executive had asked the Deputy Chair of the Authority, Cllr D Chapman, to act as an informal Member Champion for the Monitoring & Enforcement Team.

The Monitoring & Enforcement Team Manager gave the following update on a current high priority case:

6. Fernhill Cottage, Hollow Meadows – a meeting was being held with the owners new solicitors next week to see if a mutually agreeable solution could be found.

In response to a Member query he also gave a more detailed update on Midfield, Kettlethulme and confirmed that the residential caravan had been removed some time ago.

He also displayed some 'before and after' photos of enforcement cases that had been resolved.

RESOLVED:

That the report be noted.

44/15 BRADWELL NEIGHBOURHOOD PLAN EXAMINATION

Members considered the report requesting them to agree actions necessary to undertake the Bradwell Neighbourhood Plan examination, including to support the preferred choice of independent examiner.

The recommendation as set out in the report was moved, seconded, voted on and carried.

RESOLVED:

- 1. Members support the officer recommendation at paragraph 9 of the report that the preferred choice of Inspector to conduct the examination into Bradwell Neighbourhood Plan is Nigel McGurk;**
- 2. Delegated authority is granted to the Director of Planning in consultation with the Chair and Vice Chair of Planning Committee to agree any changes to this decision if necessary.**
- 3. Delegated authority is granted to the Director of Planning to undertake arrangements appropriate to the holding of the examination.**

45/15 HEAD OF LAW REPORT

Members considered and noted the report on planning appeals lodged and decided during the month.

RESOLVED:

That the report be noted.

The meeting ended at 4.08 pm